Professional Development for Non-Tenure-Track Faculty at San Francisco State University

by Jennifer Yeh, KC Culver, and Adrianna Kezar

San Francisco State University (SFSU) is a public institution and part of the 23 campuses in the California State University (CSU) system. The comprehensive university enrolls roughly 30,000 students per year. The faculty consists of 1700 members of which 55% are non-tenure-track faculty (NTTF); additionally, roughly 50% of faculty are in part-time roles. NTTF are represented by The California Faculty Association (CFA) as part of CSU’s collective bargaining agreement. CFA is a union of 2800+ lecturers, librarians, counselors, and coaches.

The Center for Equity and Excellence in Teaching and Learning (CEETL) provides professional development opportunities for faculty that promote equity-minded, innovative, and reflective learning and instructional practices. CEETL’s goals are to increase discussion about best pedagogical practices and contributions to student success, to recognize innovative teaching, and to serve as a hub for all teaching related initiatives through connecting with other campus initiatives and units. CEETL is led by a faculty director and overseen by the Assistant Vice President for Teaching and Learning. There is also an advisory board including seven faculty from across campus and several administrators who not only consult on CEETL programming but also serve as liaisons to the various colleges and the library promoting CEETL opportunities.

SFSU offers an example of an institution that provides professional development at multiple levels, with various levels of coordination and collaboration. Because of this, the case study provides a brief overview of CSU-level initiatives, as well as campus offerings in more localized spaces (e.g., student success program, departmental, and grant-funded efforts).

This case study then focuses on professional development offered through CEETL. We begin with descriptions of less-intensive forms of professional development offered to NTTF by CEETL. We discuss a faculty learning community hosted by CEETL that was developed specifically for NTTF.

CSU System

The Institute for Teaching & Learning within the CSU chancellor’s office supports instructional development across the 23 campuses through the Faculty Development Council, a consortium that works with center directors on all campuses to support the effectiveness of PD offerings. The system office offers several initiatives, including Quality Learning and Teaching, an online certification course that supports faculty in developing effective online and hybrid courses. In
partnership with the Faculty Development Council, they also sponsor an annual symposium that offers the opportunity for faculty across campuses to present scholarship on teaching and learning.

Professional Development Outside of CEETL

Professional development is also offered in several more localized spaces on campus. At San Francisco State University, we learned about initiatives being offered by the Asian American studies program, grant-funded efforts, and a student success program. While many other localized initiatives are also being pursued across campus, we briefly describe each of these as they reflect common approaches to professional development that are offered in different spaces on campus.

The Asian American Studies department created an informal mentoring program that pairs NTTF with a tenure-track faculty (TTF) mentor to help NTTF achieve their professional goals and become integrated in the institution. As an example of the potential benefits of this program, one mentor-mentee pair is working to co-publish an article and a book chapter together. In addition to the mentoring program, the department employs intentional practices—such as arranging shared office spaces so that NTTF and TTF are mixed and converting NTTF to TTF roles whenever opportunities arise—to improve the integration of NTTF within the department. The department also revised their process for hiring NTTF several years ago, creating a hiring committee to be more inclusive of diverse perspectives in the hiring process rather than using the typical model, where NTTF are hired solely by the department chair. As a result of the more collaborative hiring model, the department has a more ethnically diverse pool of NTTF, which has in turn helped students to see a greater mix of multicultural reflections within the classroom.

The ASPIRE program is a grant-funded collaboration between the Asian American Studies department and the Student Affairs and Enrollment Management office that is targeted at improving the academic success of high-needs Asian American and Pacific Islander students. The ASPIRE program includes a faculty learning community (FLC) for faculty in the College of Ethnic Studies that includes a stipend for participation. While the FLC is open to faculty across career tracks, the vast majority of past participants were NTTF. Because of this, the program created an NTTF-specific FLC cohort in Fall 2020 in order to prioritize support for NTTF during the pandemic.

Another program on campus that offers professional development for faculty is the Metro College Success Program. This program is a two-year learning community for first generation, low-income, and historically underrepresented students that offers in-class academic support, advising, and tutoring. In their first year of teaching in Metro, San Francisco State faculty who teach in the Metro program participate in a cross-campus FLC along with faculty who teach in the Metro transfer program at City College of San Francisco. These faculty are overwhelmingly NTTF because most of the courses offered in the program fulfill general education requirements.

CEETL

The institution offers a number of initiatives through the Center for Equity and Excellence in Teaching and Learning (CEETL), which is the central hub for professional development on campus. CEETL offers individualized support, workshops, events, and a certification programs that promote social justice, equity, diversity, and inclusion in learning and instruction.

NTTF Orientation

CEETL designed a new faculty orientation program containing both synchronous and asynchronous resources. While
this program targets tenure-track faculty (TTF), all of the resources are available to NTTF with several asynchronous materials, like HR and CFA messages, adjusted specifically for NTTF. CEETL also makes additional efforts to invite new NTTF to connect with those materials.

**Short Institute**

In addition, CEETL held a synchronous, in-person lecturer faculty day that targeted participation from new lecturer faculty; roughly 18 NTTF participated during the first year. As part of this experience, NTTF were able to engage in an hour-long meeting with the provost that served as advocacy for their needs. Participants voiced concerns and relayed powerful messages to the provost that would otherwise be difficult to communicate, including specific details about their lives and teaching conditions.

**Workshops**

CEETL offers a number of workshops that provide small stipends to NTTF as compensation for their time. Campus administrators and TTF who participate in these workshops do not receive additional compensation to attend workshops, as professional development is an expectation for faculty in these roles. Depending on the length and expectations for workshops, NTTF and graduate teaching assistants receive a stipend of $50-$75 per hour. Compensating NTTF for participation in workshops send the message that the professional development of instructors must be supported if “teaching well” is expected.

**Certification**

The Pedagogies for Inclusive Excellence (PIE) is a certificate program offered through CEETL; PIE offers two certificates, the Quality Learning and Teaching (QLT) Online Certificate and the First Year (FY) PIE Certificate the program is 60 hours total, split into four programs: an intensive institute, workshop series, FLC, and the creation of a teaching portfolio, each of which takes about 15 hours to complete. Faculty usually complete the certificate in about 2-3 years; they are compensated for completing each of the four programs and receive a bonus for earning the certificate. Certificates are added to faculty member’s personnel file as artifacts that contribute to evaluation and potential promotion.

**NTTF- Specific Faculty Learning Community**

CEETL hosts several faculty learning communities (FLCs), all of which are open to NTTF. In this case study, we highlight an FLC that was developed specifically for NTTF in Spring 2020, called “Exploring, Fostering, and Supporting Lecturer Contributions.” The expectations and compensation for participants in the NTTF-specific FLC were the same as other FLCs offered by CEETL. However, the participant makeup, purpose, and content differed. The purpose of this FLC was to understand the shared meaningful experiences of NTTF across campus and to foster the development of a professional network among participants, with the long-term goal of helping NTTF across campus advocate for recognition within departments and the institution.

Following campus closures due to the pandemic halfway during the semester, the purpose and content of this FLC shifted to address issues such as job security, changes in pedagogy, and available resources, providing a space for NTTF to support one another. Of the six sessions held during the semester, a handful focused on pedagogical resources for teaching online; other meetings brought in the CFA union representative to discuss rights for NTTF with the university and overall, provided a space for sharing both positive and negative experiences as well as recognizing ways in which
NTTF are exploited by the university and how to push back. Participants worked together to deliver a two-part final product containing 1) resources on tips and best practices for online student engagement and 2) best practices for departments to implement in order to support NTTF in remote modalities.

**Influences on Professional Development in CEETL**

This case offers an important opportunity to examine various influences that shape the professional development offering at SFSU. We begin by discussing influences on the creation of an NTTF-specific FLC. One important influence is that the current faculty director of CEETL is a member of the Asian American Studies department. Thus, the culture of inclusion for NTTF in the department, as well as the professional development initiative created as part of the Aspire program, have informed the director’s approaches to professional development in CEETL. In addition, the faculty member who facilitated the NTTF-specific FLC is also a member of this department who had previously participated in the FLC offered through the Aspire program. Thus, the NTTF-specific FLC benefitted from the faculty director’s active involvement in creating equity for NTTF, having working knowledge of previous efforts, and from the culture of social justice and inclusion that is prevalent in the department. These influences also helped to facilitate the success of the NTTF-specific FLC.

Another influence on CEETL’s offerings is CSU’s Institute for Teaching & Learning. The Faculty Development Council provides an opportunity for faculty developers to learn from one another about implementing effective programs. In the past, SFSU faculty could also participate in CSU’s Quality Learning and Teaching certificate program. However, CEETL recently developed their own Online Teaching Institute (OTI) to replace the CSU-level program. The OTI is clearly influenced by the CSU-level initiative but is more tailored to SFSU’s environment and focus on equity. While OTI can benefit student success at SFSU by being more narrowly focused, there are costs to developing and maintaining a campus-specific program that is similar to one offered through the CSU chancellor’s office.

**Best Practices for Supporting NTTF**

The professional development initiatives we learned about at San Francisco State University reflect a number of best practices for supporting NTTF. We highlight several of these best practices evident in the different spaces on campus where professional development is being offered.

**Best Practices in Localized Spaces**

- The Asian American Studies department built a culture of respect for NTTF and mixes TT and NTT faculty in shared spaces across departments, promoting inclusion and integration of NTTF.
- The department’s mentoring program pairs NTTF with a TTF to support their integration and success.
- When providing opportunities for advancement and growth professionally, the department values overall expertise over TT position. Faculty members are considered as a whole and both NTTF and TTF expertise are valued equally.
- The Aspire program and Metro program both offer professional development for faculty to better support high needs and underrepresented student populations on campus.

**Best Practices in CEETL**

- The Many CEETL programs offer stipends for NTTF to compensate for their time. Compensating NTTF for PD convey
the message that efforts to go above and beyond their position are recognized and that their time is valued by the institution.

✔ Lecturer faculty day offered the opportunity for NTTF to develop knowledge of institutional resources and also allowed them to voice NTTF-specific issues to the provost. By creating a space specifically for NTTF, this short institute offered the opportunity for NTTF to comfortably share details about their lives and working conditions with others who face similar challenges.

✔ The faculty director of CEETL sees the position as an opportunity to advocate across campus for better support of NTTF, including encouraging departmental leaders to transition NTTF into TTF roles when there is a match. Additionally, the director is working with upper-level administrators to create more consistency of NTTF-related policies and to create more support for the participation of NTTF in professional development.

**Best Practices in the NTTF-Specific FLC**

✔ The program provided compensation for participation in a NTTF-specific FLC.

✔ The FLC is held over a semester rather than a year so that NTTF and particularly part-time NTTF can participate.

✔ The FLC was facilitated by an NTTF who had previously participated in an FLC.

✔ In addition to focusing on instructional effectiveness, this FLC was intentionally created to help NTTF develop a sense of community by connecting participants with peers across campus, which can help them collectively advocate for greater acknowledgement and recognition.

**Learning Community: Design Summary**

In this section we provide a quick summary of the design of the NTTF-specific faculty learning community offered by CEETL at San Francisco State University, as it offers a model of access for and inclusion of NTTF to support their success.

**Purpose and Objectives:** The purpose is to better understand the shared experiences of NTTF across campus and develop professional networks for participants, with a long-term goal of helping NTTF advocate for recognition and equity within departments and the institution.

**Participants:** The FLC had 10 NTTF participants from across campus.

**Delivery Mode:** The FLC originally met in person; however, all activity was moved online because of the pandemic.

**Structure and Length:** The FLC included 6 sessions held over one semester.

**Content:** The FLC provided pedagogical and career resources. Sessions focused on teaching effectiveness, including effective teaching online. The FLC also included career development resources such as a discussion with CFA union representative so that participants could be informed about their rights as NTTF.

**Facilitation:** Facilitated by a NTTF who had previously participated in an FLC.

**Deliverables:** Participants created a group project that pooled resources and tips on 1) best practices for online engagement and 2) best practices for departments to implement for supporting NTTF in remote modalities.
**Assessment:** Participants completed reflections about their experiences in the FLC and the facilitator also wrote a detailed reflection that discussed on each participant’s contributions, challenges encountered and adjustments made, and the outcomes and accomplishments related to the FLC.

**Compensation and Recognition:** NTTF received $250 for participating and the facilitator received $1500 for leading the FLC.

**Additional Resources**

CEETL. Faculty learning community leads. [https://ceetl.sfsu.edu/teaching-and-learning-communities](https://ceetl.sfsu.edu/teaching-and-learning-communities) [offers an overview of the responsibilities for FLC leads and information for participants].

Faculty Affairs and Professional Development. Lecturer faculty at SFSU. [https://facaffairs.sfsu.edu/lecturer-faculty](https://facaffairs.sfsu.edu/lecturer-faculty) [offers an overview of NTTF-specific professional development offerings at CEETL and resources on benefits, union, etc.]

---

*This project is funded from the Improving Undergraduate STEM Education program within the Department of Undergraduate Education of the National Science Foundation, under Grant No. NSF DUE-1914784.*

Visit The Delphi Project on the Changing Faculty and Student Success for more case studies of professional development that is accessible and welcoming of adjuncts and non-tenure-track faculty and a wide range of resources and toolkits to better support faculty off the tenure track at: pullias.usc.edu/delphi.